

## Orchestrator - Bug #45327

### cephadm: Orch daemon add is not idempotent

04/29/2020 10:35 AM - Sebastian Wagner

<b>Status:</b>	New	<b>% Done:</b>	0%
<b>Priority:</b>	High		
<b>Assignee:</b>	Juan Miguel Olmo Martínez		
<b>Category:</b>	cephadm		
<b>Target version:</b>			
<b>Source:</b>	Q/A	<b>Reviewed:</b>	
<b>Tags:</b>		<b>Affected Versions:</b>	
<b>Backport:</b>	octopus	<b>ceph-qa-suite:</b>	
<b>Regression:</b>	No	<b>Pull request ID:</b>	
<b>Severity:</b>	3 - minor	<b>Crash signature:</b>	
<b>Description</b>			
<pre>audit [DBG] from='client.14180 v1:172.21.15.139:0/1866757471' entity='client.admin' cmd=[{"prefix": "orch daemon add", "daemon_type": "mon", "placement": "smithi139:[v1:172.21.15.139:6789]=c", "target": ["mon-mgr", ""]}]: dispatch audit [INF] from='mgr.14141 v1:172.21.15.131:0/1812629321' entity='mgr.y' cmd=[{"prefix": "auth get", "entity": "mon."}]: dispatch audit [DBG] from='mgr.14141 v1:172.21.15.131:0/1812629321' entity='mgr.y' cmd=[{"prefix": "config generate-minimal-conf"}]: dispatch cephadm [INF] Deploying daemon mon.c on smithi139 audit [DBG] from='mgr.14141 v1:172.21.15.131:0/1812629321' entity='mgr.y' cmd=[{"prefix": "config get", "who": "mon.c", "key": "container_image"}]: dispatch audit [DBG] from='client.14180 v1:172.21.15.139:0/1866757471' entity='client.admin' cmd=[{"prefix": "orch daemon add", "daemon_type": "mon", "placement": "smithi139:[v1:172.21.15.139:6789]=c", "target": ["mon-mgr", ""]}]: dispatch  Remote method threw exception: Traceback (most recent call last): Error EINVAL: Traceback (most recent call last):   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/mgr_module.py", line 1153, in _handle_command     return self.handle_command(inbuf, cmd)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/_interface.py", line 110, in handle_command     return dispatch[cmd['prefix']].call(self, cmd, inbuf)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/mgr_module.py", line 308, in call     return self.func(mgr, **kwargs)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/_interface.py", line 72, in &lt;lambda&gt;     wrapper_copy = lambda *l_args, **l_kwargs: wrapper(*l_args, **l_kwargs)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/_interface.py", line 63, in wrapper     return func(*args, **kwargs)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/module.py", line 658, in _daemon_add_misc     completion = self.add_mon(spec)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/_interface.py", line 1542, in inner     completion = self._oremove(method_name, args, kwargs)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/orchestrator/_interface.py", line 1614, in _oremove     return mgr.remote(o, meth, *args, **kwargs)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/mgr_module.py", line 1515, in remote     args, kwargs) RuntimeError: Remote method threw exception: Traceback (most recent call last):   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/cephadm/module.py", line 2740, in add_mon     return self._add_daemon('mon', spec, self._create_mon)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/cephadm/module.py", line 2652, in _add_daemon     create_func, config_func)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/cephadm/module.py", line 2667, in _create_daemons     spec.service_id, name)   File "/usr/share/ceph/mgr/cephadm/module.py", line 1228, in get_unique_name     raise orchestrator.OrchestratorValidationError('name %s already in use', forcename)</pre>			

```
orchestrator._interface.OrchestratorValidationError: ('name %s already in use', 'c')
```

[http://pulpito.ceph.com/teuthology-2020-04-27\\_03:30:02-rados-octopus-distro-basic-smithi/4988571/](http://pulpito.ceph.com/teuthology-2020-04-27_03:30:02-rados-octopus-distro-basic-smithi/4988571/)

#### Related issues:

Related to Orchestrator - Bug #44824: cephadm: adding osd device is not idemp...	<b>New</b>
Duplicated by Orchestrator - Bug #45296: cephadm: daemon add mon failure: orc...	<b>Duplicate</b>
Duplicated by Orchestrator - Bug #46854: Error ENOENT: name mon.smithi074 alr...	<b>Duplicate</b>
Duplicated by Orchestrator - Bug #47709: orchestrator._interface.Orchestrator...	<b>Duplicate</b>

#### History

##### #1 - 04/29/2020 10:35 AM - Sebastian Wagner

- Subject changed from *Orch daemon add is not idempotent* to *cephadm: Orch daemon add is not idempotent*

##### #2 - 04/29/2020 10:44 AM - Sebastian Wagner

- Priority changed from *Normal* to *High*

##### #3 - 04/29/2020 11:49 AM - Sebastian Wagner

- Duplicated by Bug #45296: *cephadm: daemon add mon failure: orchestrator.\_interface.OrchestratorValidationError: ('name %s already in use', 'b') added*

##### #4 - 04/29/2020 01:29 PM - Sebastian Wagner

Ok,

```
ceph orch apply ...
```

is already idempotent.

On the other hand,

```
ceph orch daemon add ...
```

is supposed to be raw and direct without any magic behind it. I for one would prefer to have Teuthology invoke `apply` instead of `daemon add`.

##### #5 - 04/29/2020 02:54 PM - Joshua Schmid

I'd argue that we should only maintain one command for service creation and I would recommend going with for `apply`.

We should adapt the teuthology codepath to use/support `apply` as well.

**#6 - 05/04/2020 07:51 PM - Neha Ojha**

- Backport set to octopus

/a/yuriw-2020-05-02\_20:02:46-rados-wip-yuri6-testing-2020-04-30-2259-octopus-distro-basic-smithi/5016611/

**#7 - 05/09/2020 09:08 PM - Sebastian Wagner**

- Source set to Q/A

**#8 - 05/14/2020 01:38 PM - Sebastian Wagner**

- Related to Bug #44824: cephadm: adding osd device is not idempotent added

**#9 - 06/29/2020 12:16 PM - Sebastian Wagner**

`daemon add` is too low level. If we want commands to be idempotent, we have to remove calling them cephadm.py

**#10 - 08/03/2020 02:23 PM - Sebastian Wagner**

[https://pulpito.ceph.com/swagner-2020-08-03\\_12:11:23-rados:cephadm-wip-swagner-testing-2020-08-03-1038-distro-basic-smithi/5284050/](https://pulpito.ceph.com/swagner-2020-08-03_12:11:23-rados:cephadm-wip-swagner-testing-2020-08-03-1038-distro-basic-smithi/5284050/)

```
> sudo /home/ubuntu/ceph-test/cephadm --image quay.io/ceph-ci/ceph:4502cc1b194810b439c691dc8aeabee06dcc5c6
b shell -c /etc/ceph/ceph.conf -k /etc/ceph/ceph.client.admin.keyring --fsid 2523a68e-d589-11ea-a070-001a4aab8
30c -- ceph orch daemon add mon smithi193:172.21.15.193=smithi193
cephadm 2020-08-03T13:02:24.253615+0000 mgr.smithi089.ppezhp (mgr.14169) 63 : cephadm [INF] Deploying daemon m
gr.smithi193.xqzdep on smithi193
cluster 2020-08-03T13:02:24.597060+0000 mgr.smithi089.ppezhp (mgr.14169) 64 : cluster [DBG] pgmap v34: 1 pgs:
1 unknown; 0 B data, 0 B used, 0 B / 0 B avail
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.255138+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 278 : audit [INF] from='client.? 172.21.15.89:0/23
56875247' entity='client.admin' cmd='[{"prefix": "osd crush tunables", "profile": "default"}]': finished
cluster 2020-08-03T13:02:25.255187+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 279 : cluster [DBG] osdmap e7: 0 total, 0 up, 0
in
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.817810+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 282 : audit [DBG] from='mgr.14169 172.21.15.89:0/3
85454869' entity='mgr.smithi089.ppezhp' cmd=[{"prefix": "config get", "who": "mon", "key": "public_network"}]:
dispatch
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.818730+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 283 : audit [INF] from='mgr.14169 172.21.15.89:0/3
85454869' entity='mgr.smithi089.ppezhp' cmd=[{"prefix": "auth get", "entity": "mon."}]: dispatch
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.819219+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 284 : audit [DBG] from='mgr.14169 172.21.15.89:0/3
85454869' entity='mgr.smithi089.ppezhp' cmd=[{"prefix": "config get", "who": "mon", "key": "public_network"}]:
dispatch
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.819717+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 285 : audit [DBG] from='mgr.14169 172.21.15.89:0/3
85454869' entity='mgr.smithi089.ppezhp' cmd=[{"prefix": "config generate-minimal-conf"}]: dispatch
audit 2020-08-03T13:02:25.820440+0000 mon.smithi089 (mon.0) 286 : audit [DBG] from='mgr.14169 172.21.15.89:0/3
85454869' entity='mgr.smithi089.ppezhp' cmd=[{"prefix": "config get", "who": "mon.smithi193", "key": "containe
r_image"}]: dispatch
cephadm 2020-08-03T13:02:25.820087+0000 mgr.smithi089.ppezhp (mgr.14169) 65 : cephadm [INF] Deploying daemon m
on.smithi193 on smithi193
cluster 2020-08-03T13:02:26.597340+0000 mgr.smithi089.ppezhp (mgr.14169) 66 : cluster [DBG] pgmap v36: 1 pgs:
1 unknown; 0 B data, 0 B used, 0 B / 0 B avail
Error EINVAL: name mon.smithi193 already in use
```

**#11 - 08/07/2020 07:55 AM - Sebastian Wagner**

- Duplicated by Bug #46854: Error ENOENT: name mon.smithi074 already in use seen on octopus added

**#12 - 11/19/2020 10:58 AM - Sebastian Wagner**

- Duplicated by Bug #47709: orchestrator.\_interface.OrchestratorValidationError: name mon.c already in use added

**#13 - 12/10/2020 10:52 PM - Sebastian Wagner**

ok:

**We must not call daemon add** in Teuthology. It's just too low level and not meant to be idempotent.

Would be great, if someone want to take this.

**#14 - 12/11/2020 01:28 PM - Juan Miguel Olmo Martínez**

- Assignee set to Juan Miguel Olmo Martínez